IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF LOUISIANA

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,	
Plaintiff,)	Civil Action No.
v.)	Civil Action 110.
LARRY DELATTE)	Judge
Defendant.	

CONSENT DECREE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.	BACKGROUND
II.	JURISDICTION
III.	PARTIES BOUND
IV.	<u>DEFINITIONS</u>
V.	STATEMENT OF PURPOSE
VI.	PAYMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS
VII.	FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH CONSENT DECREE
VIII.	COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFF
IX	RESERVATION OF RIGHTS BY UNITED STATES
X.	COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY SETTLING DEFENDANT 8
XI.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION 8
XII.	CERTIFICATION
XIII.	NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS
XIV.	RETENTION OF JURISDICTION
XV.	INTEGRATION/APPENDICES
XVI.	LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT 10
XVII.	SIGNATORIES/SERVICE
XVIII.	FINAL JUDGMENT 11

I. <u>BACKGROUND</u>

- A. The United States of America ("United States"), on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), contemporaneously filed a complaint in this matter pursuant to Section 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, 42 U.S.C. § 9607, as amended ("CERCLA"), seeking reimbursement of response costs incurred or to be incurred for response actions taken or to be taken at or in connection with the release or threatened release of hazardous substances at the Delatte Metals Superfund Site located near Ponchatoula, Tangipahoa Parish, Louisiana ("the Site").
- B. The defendant that has entered into this Consent Decree ("Settling Defendant") does not admit any liability to Plaintiff arising out of the transactions or occurrences alleged in the complaint.
- C. In response to the release or threatened release of hazardous substances at or from the Site, EPA undertook response actions at the Site pursuant to Section 104 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9604, and may undertake additional response actions in the future. Battery crushing, recycling, and smelting ventures were operated at the Site for decades and caused extensive soil and groundwater contamination onsite and in the surrounding area. EPA proposed the Site for listing on the National Priorities List ("NPL") in July 1998 and listed the Site in January 1999. EPA conducted investigations and extensive removal and remedial actions at the Site to address the contamination. EPA's final close out report was completed in March 2005. The Site was deleted from the NPL in August 2005. EPA continues to conduct periodic reviews at the Site.
- D. In performing response actions at the Site, the United States has incurred costs and will incur additional response costs in the future.
- E. The United States alleges that Settling Defendant is a responsible party pursuant to Section 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a), and is jointly and severally liable for response costs incurred and to be incurred at the Site.
- F. The United States has reviewed the Financial Information submitted by Settling Defendant to determine whether Settling Defendant is financially able to pay response costs incurred and to be incurred at the Site. Based upon this Financial Information, the United States has determined that Settling Defendant has limited financial ability to pay for response costs incurred and to be incurred at the Site.
- G. Settling Defendant represents that he does not and will not claim any current ownership interest in the land that comprises the Site.
- H. Settling Defendant represents that the three corporations that he formed and managed for the conduct of operations at the Site, namely, Delatte Metals, Inc., Delatte Lead, Inc., and

Delatte Industries, Inc. (also known as Larry Delatte Industries, Inc.), are no longer in business and have no assets remaining.

I. The United States and Settling Defendant agree, and this Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that this Consent Decree has been negotiated by the Parties in good faith, that settlement of this matter will avoid prolonged and complicated litigation between the Parties, and that this Consent Decree is fair, reasonable, and in the public interest.

THEREFORE, with the consent of the Parties to this Decree, it is ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:

II. JURISDICTION

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1345 and 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613(b) and also has personal jurisdiction over Settling Defendant. Solely for the purposes of this Consent Decree and the underlying complaint, Settling Defendant waives all objections and defenses that he may have to jurisdiction of the Court or to venue in this District. Settling Defendant shall not challenge the terms of this Consent Decree or this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Decree.

III. PARTIES BOUND

2. This Consent Decree is binding upon the United States and upon Settling Defendant and his heirs, successors, and assigns. Any change in ownership or corporate or other legal status, including, but not limited to, any transfer of assets or real or personal property, shall in no way alter the status or responsibilities of Settling Defendant under this Consent Decree.

IV. DEFINITIONS

- 3. Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this Consent Decree which are defined in CERCLA or in regulations promulgated under CERCLA shall have the meaning assigned to them in CERCLA or in such regulations. Whenever terms listed below are used in this Consent Decree or in any appendix attached hereto, the following definitions shall apply:
- a. "CERCLA" shall mean the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 9601, et seq.
- b. "Consent Decree" shall mean this Consent Decree and all appendices attached hereto. In the event of conflict between this Consent Decree and any appendix, this Consent Decree shall control.
- c. "Day" shall mean a calendar day. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal holiday, the

period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.

- d. "DOJ" shall mean the United States Department of Justice and any successor departments, agencies or instrumentalities of the United States.
- e. "EPA" shall mean the United States Environmental Protection Agency and any successor departments, agencies or instrumentalities of the United States.
- f. "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund" shall mean the Hazardous Substance Superfund established by the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507.
- g. "Financial Information" shall mean the financial documents provided by Settling Defendant to the United States, including federal income tax returns for the years 1999 through 2006 and the Ability to Pay Claim Form dated February 27, 2008.
- h. "Interest" shall mean interest at the rate specified for interest on investments of the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund established by 26 U.S.C. § 9507, compounded annually on October 1 of each year, in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a). The applicable rate of interest shall be the rate in effect at the time the interest accrues. The rate of interest is subject to change on October 1 of each year.
- i. "Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by an Arabic numeral or an upper or lower case letter.
 - j. "Parties" shall mean the United States and the Settling Defendant.
 - k. "Plaintiff" shall mean the United States.
- 1. "Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by a Roman numeral.
 - m. "Settling Defendant" shall mean Larry Delatte.
- n. "Site" shall mean the Delatte Metals Superfund Site, located at 19113 Weinberger Road near Ponchatoula, Tangipahoa Parish, Louisiana, and generally shown on the map included in Appendix A.
- o. "United States" shall mean the United States of America, including its departments, agencies and instrumentalities.

V. STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

4. By entering into this Consent Decree, the mutual objective of the Parties is for Settling

Defendant to make a cash payment to resolve its alleged civil liability for the Site as provided in the Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff in Section VIII, and subject to the Reservations of Rights by United States in Section IX.

VI. PAYMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS

- 5. Within 30 days after entry of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant shall pay to the United States ten thousand dollars (\$10,000).
- 6. Settling Defendant's payment shall be made by certified or cashier's check made payable to "U.S. Department of Justice," referencing the name and address of the party making payment, EPA Region Site ID Number LAD 052510344, DOJ Case Number 90-11-3-09127, and the Civil Action Number. Settling Defendant shall send the check to:

U.S. Attorney's Office for the Eastern District of Louisiana Attention: Financial Litigation Unit 500 Poydras St., Room B-210 New Orleans, Louisiana, 70130.

- 7. At the time of payment, Settling Defendant shall send notice that payment has been made to EPA and DOJ in accordance with Section XIII (Notices and Submissions) and to EPA Cincinnati Finance Office, 26 Martin Luther King Drive, Cincinnati, Ohio 45268. Such notice shall reference EPA Region and Site ID Number LAD 052510344, DOJ Case Number 90-11-3-09127, and the Civil Action Number.
- 8. The total amount to be paid pursuant to Paragraph 5 shall be deposited in the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund.

VII. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH CONSENT DECREE

9. <u>Interest on Late Payments</u>. If Settling Defendant fails to make any payment under Paragraph 5 by the required due date, Interest shall accrue on the unpaid balance through the date of payment.

10. Stipulated Penalty.

- a. If any amounts due under Paragraph 5 are not paid by the required date, Settling Defendant shall be in violation of this Consent Decree and shall pay, as a stipulated penalty, in addition to the Interest required by Paragraph 9, \$300.00 per day that such payment is late.
- b. Stipulated penalties are due and payable within 30 days of the date of the demand for payment of the penalties by the United States. All payments to EPA under this

Paragraph shall be identified as "stipulated penalties" and shall be made by certified or cashier's check made payable to "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund." The check, or a letter accompanying the check, shall reference the name and address of the party making payment, the Site name, EPA Region and Site ID Number LAD 052510344, DOJ Case Number 90-11-3-09127, and the Civil Action Number. Settling Defendant shall send the check (and any accompanying letter) to:

US Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center PO Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

- c. At the time of each payment, Settling Defendant shall send notice that payment has been made to EPA and DOJ in accordance with Paragraph 7.
- d. Penalties shall accrue as provided in this Paragraph regardless of whether EPA has notified Settling Defendant of the violation or made a demand for payment, but need only be paid upon demand. All penalties shall begin to accrue on the day after payment is due and shall continue to accrue through the date of payment. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall prevent the simultaneous accrual of separate penalties for separate violations of this Consent Decree.
- 11. If the United States brings an action to enforce this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant shall reimburse the United States for all costs of such action, including but not limited to costs of attorney time.
- 12. Payments made under this Section shall be in addition to any other remedies or sanctions available to Plaintiff by virtue of Settling Defendant's failure to comply with the requirements of this Consent Decree.
- 13. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Section, the United States may, in its unreviewable discretion, waive payment of any portion of the stipulated penalties that have accrued pursuant to this Consent Decree. Payment of stipulated penalties shall not excuse Settling Defendants from payment as required by Section VI or from performance of any other requirements of this Consent Decree.

VIII. COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFF

14. Except as specifically provided in Section IX (Reservation of Rights by United States), the United States covenants not to sue or to take administrative action against Settling Defendant pursuant to Sections 106 and 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606 and 9607(a), with regard to the Site. With respect to present and future liability, this covenant shall take effect upon receipt by EPA of all amounts required by Section VI (Payment of Response Costs) and any amount due under Section VII (Failure to Comply with Consent Decree). This covenant not to

sue also is conditioned upon the veracity and completeness of the Financial Information provided to EPA by Settling Defendant and the certification made by Settling Defendant in Paragraph 24. If the Financial Information provided by Settling Defendant or the certification made by Settling Defendant in Paragraph 24 is subsequently determined by EPA to be false or, in any material respect, inaccurate, Settling Defendant shall forfeit all payments made pursuant to this Consent Decree and this covenant not to sue and the contribution protection in Paragraph 21 shall be null and void. Such forfeiture shall not constitute liquidated damages and shall not in any way foreclose the United States' right to pursue any other causes of action arising from Settling Defendant's false or materially inaccurate information. This covenant not to sue extends only to Settling Defendant and does not extend to any other person.

IX. RESERVATION OF RIGHTS BY UNITED STATES

- 15. The United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all rights against Settling Defendant with respect to all matters not expressly included within the Covenant Not to Sue by United States in Paragraph 14. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States reserves all rights against Settling Defendant with respect to:
- a. liability for failure of Settling Defendant to meet a requirement of this Consent Decree;
 - b. criminal liability;
- c. liability for damages for injury to, destruction of, or loss of natural resources, and for the costs of any natural resource damage assessments;
- d. liability based on the ownership or operation of the Site by Settling Defendant after signature of this Consent Decree by Settling Defendant;
- e. liability based on Settling Defendant's transportation, treatment, storage, or disposal, or the arrangement for the transportation, treatment, storage, or disposal of a hazardous substance or a solid waste at or in connection with the Site, after signature of this Consent Decree by Settling Defendant; and
- f. liability arising from the past, present, or future disposal, release or threat of release of a hazardous substance, pollutant, or contaminant outside of the Site.
- 16. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, EPA reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, the right to reinstitute or reopen this action, or to commence a new action seeking relief other than as provided in this Consent Decree, if the Financial Information provided by Settling Defendant, or the financial certification made by Settling Defendant in Paragraph 24, is false or, in an material respect, inaccurate.

X. COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY SETTLING DEFENDANT

- 17. Settling Defendant covenants not to sue and agrees not to assert any claims or causes of action against the United States, or its contractors or employees, with respect to the Site or this Consent Decree, including but not limited to:
- a. any direct or indirect claim for reimbursement from the Hazardous Substance Superfund based on Sections 106(b)(2), 107, 111, 112, or 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606(b)(2), 9607, 9611, 9612, or 9613, or any other provision of law;
- b. any claim arising out of response actions at or in connection with the Site, including any claim under the United States Constitution, the Tucker Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1491, the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended, or at common law; or
- c. any claim against the United States pursuant to Sections 107 or 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613, relating to the Site.

Except as provided in Paragraph 19 (Waiver of Claims) and Paragraph 23 (Waiver of Claim-Splitting Defenses), these covenants not to sue shall not apply in the event the United States brings a cause of action or issues an order pursuant to the reservations set forth in Paragraph 15 (c) - (e), but only to the extent that Settling Defendant's claims arise from the same response action or response costs that the United States is seeking pursuant to the applicable reservation.

- 18. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be deemed to constitute approval or preauthorization of a claim within the meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. 300.700(d).
- 19. Settling Defendant agrees not to assert any CERCLA claims or causes of action that it may have for all matters relating to the Site, including for contribution or cost recovery, against any other person. This waiver shall not apply with respect to any defense, claim, or cause of action that Settling Defendant may have against any person if such person asserts a claim or cause of action relating to the Site against Settling Defendant.

XI. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

20. Except as provided in Paragraph 19, nothing in this Consent Decree shall be construed to create any rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any person not a Party to this Consent Decree. Except as provided in Paragraph 19, the Parties expressly reserve any and all rights, defenses, claims, demands, and causes of action which they may have with respect to any matter, transaction, or occurrence relating in any way to the Site against any person not a Party hereto.

- 21. The Parties agree, and by entering this Consent Decree this Court finds, that Settling Defendant is entitled, as of the date of entry of this Consent Decree, to protection from contribution actions or claims as provided by Section 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(2), for "matters addressed" in this Consent Decree. The "matters addressed" in this Consent Decree are all response actions taken or to be taken and all response costs incurred or to be incurred, at or in connection with the Site, by the United States or any other person. The "matters addressed" in this Consent Decree do not include those response costs or response actions as to which the United States has exercised its rights pursuant to the reservations in subparagraph 15(d) or (e) of this Consent Decree.
- 22. Settling Defendant also agrees that, with respect to any suit or claim for contribution or cost recovery brought against it for matters related to this Consent Decree, it will notify EPA and DOJ in writing within 10 days of service of the complaint or claim upon it. In addition, Settling Defendant shall notify EPA and DOJ within 10 days of service or receipt of any Motion for Summary Judgment, and within 10 days of receipt of any order from a court setting a case for trial, for matters related to this Consent Decree.
- 23. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other relief relating to the Site, Settling Defendant shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or claim based upon the principles of waiver, *res judicata*, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting, or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by the United States in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case; provided, however, that nothing in this Paragraph affects the enforceability of the Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff set forth in Section VIII.

XII. CERTIFICATION

24. Settling Defendant hereby certifies that, to the best of its knowledge and belief, after thorough inquiry, he has submitted to EPA Financial Information that fairly, accurately, and materially sets forth his financial circumstances, and that those circumstances have not materially changed between the time the Financial Information was submitted to EPA and the time Settling Defendant executes this Consent Decree.

XIII. NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS

25. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree, notice is required to be given or a document is required to be sent by one party to another, it shall be directed to the individuals at the addresses specified below, unless those individuals or their successors give notice of a change to the other Parties in writing. Written notice as specified herein shall constitute complete satisfaction of any written notice requirement of the Consent Decree with respect to the United States, EPA, DOJ, and Settling Defendant, respectively.

As to the United States:

As to DOJ:

Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice (DJ # 90-11-3-09127) P.O. Box 7611 Washington, D.C. 20044-7611

As to EPA:

Barbara A. Nann Assistant Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 6 1445 Ross Avenue, Suite 1200 Dallas, TX 75202

As to Settling Defendant:

Larry Delatte 19222 Weinberger Road Ponchatoula, Louisiana 70454

XIV. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

26. This Court shall retain jurisdiction over this matter for the purpose of interpreting and enforcing the terms of this Consent Decree.

XV. INTEGRATION/APPENDICES

27. This Consent Decree and its appendix constitute the final, complete and exclusive Consent Decree and understanding between the Parties with respect to the settlement embodied in this Consent Decree. The Parties acknowledge that there are no representations, agreements or understandings relating to the settlement other than those expressly contained in this Consent Decree. The attached "Appendix A" is the map of the Site and is incorporated into this Consent Decree.

XVI. LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

28. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a period of not less than 30 days for public notice and comment. The United States reserves the right to withdraw or withhold

its consent if the comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations which indicate that this Consent Decree is inappropriate, improper, or inadequate. Settling Defendant consents to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice.

29. If for any reason this Court should decline to approve this Consent Decree in the form presented, this Consent Decree is voidable at the sole discretion of any party and the terms of the Consent Decree may not be used as evidence in any litigation between the Parties.

XVII. SIGNATORIES/SERVICE

- 30. Settling Defendant and the Assistant Attorney General of the United States Department of Justice each certifies that he is authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and bind legally such Party to this document.
- 31. Settling Defendant hereby agrees not to oppose entry of this Consent Decree by this Court or to challenge any provision of this Consent Decree, unless the United States has notified Settling Defendant in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree.
- 32. Settling Defendant hereby agrees to accept service by mail and to waive the formal service requirements set forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any applicable local rules of this Court, including but not limited to, service of a summons. The Parties agree that Settling Defendant need not file an answer to the complaint in this action unless or until the Court expressly declines to enter this Consent Decree.

XVIII. FINAL JUDGMENT

33. Upon approval and entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, this Consent Decree shall constitute the final judgment between the United States and Settling Defendant. The Court finds that there is no just reason for delay and therefore enters this judgment as a final judgment under Fed. R. Civ. P. 54 and 58.

2000

20 OKDEKED I	HIS DAY OF	, 2008.
	United States District Juc	Hga
	ige	

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTIES enter into this Consent Decree in the matter of <u>United States v.</u> <u>Larry Delatte</u>, relating to the Delatte Metals Superfund Site.

FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA:

Date: 17 June 2008

RONALD J. TENPAS

Assistant Attorney General
United States Department of Justice
Environment and Natural Resources Division

Date: 6-17-08

JASON T. BARBEAU
Trial Attorney
Environmental Enforcement Section
Environment and Natural Resources Division
U.S. Department of Justice
P.O. Box 7611, Ben Franklin Station
Washington, D.C. 20044

JAMES LETTEN United States Attorney Eastern District of Louisiana

SHARON D. SMITH, La. Bar No. 17146 Assistant United States Attorney U.S. Attorney's Office, Eastern District of Louisiana Hale Boggs Federal Building 500 Poydras Street, RM B210 New Orleans, Louisiana 70130 THE UNDERSIGNED PARTIES enter into this Consent Decree in the matter of <u>United States v.</u> <u>Larry Delatte</u>, relating to the Delatte Metals Superfund Site.

FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA (continued):

Date: <u>7308</u>

SAMUEL COLEMAN, P.E. Director, Superfund Division
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 6
1445 Ross Avenue
Dallas, Texas 75202-2733

Date: $\frac{7/3}{08}$

BARBARA A. NANN Assistant Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 6 1445 Ross Avenue Dallas, TX 75202 THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree in the matter of <u>United States v.</u> <u>Larry Delatte</u>, relating to the Delatte Metals Superfund Site.

FOR DEFENDANT LARRY DELATTE, pro se

Date: <u>5/7/</u>(

LARRY DELATTE
19222 Weinberger Road
Ponchatoula, Louisiana 70454

APPENDIX A SITE MAP

